## Contemporary forms of market Pharmaceutical wholesaling in Ghana questioning current modes of regulation





Carine Baxerres – IRD – MERIT (Benin)
Daniel K. Arhinful – NMIMR (Ghana)

14th EASA conference - 23th of July 2016

# BERMAND.

### To question pharmaceutical wholesaling

- Pharmaceuticals : an **ideal window** into studying **contemporary societies** and **understanding their evolutions**
- A scientific, therapeutic and market-oriented object
- One of the most **dynamic** and **lucrative economical fields**: important market to study
- From early 1980's, pharmaceutical anthropology study the "social life of pharmaceutical"
- Different "biographical stages", from which wholesaling has not been much studied
- It's **an important stage** to study the **functioning of the market**: political and economical actors in play



### Methodology of the research

After a 1<sup>st</sup> study in the informal market of Benin (2005-08) and its market mechanisms, this study conducted from August 2014 to June 2016 in Ghana

- √ Study of the formal pharmaceutical wholesaling in Accra
- ✓ Ethnographies in the Okaishie market with a wholesalerretailer and with a wholesaler-importer: 40 sessions of participative observation of 4h each
- √ Semi-directive interviews with
  - 10 retailers + following when they purchase
  - 33 heads or sales representatives of wholesalers or firms
  - 3 informal intermediaries in Okaishie
  - 10 institutional actors (regulation agencies, transnational actors)



#### **Research question**

- > From pharmaceutical wholesaling in Ghana
  - what do we learn about contemporary markets' modes of functioning?
  - what do we learn about negotiations and tensions between State regulation and Market regulation
- **Economical** and **political issues** about the Market, but as well considering pharmaceuticals, **public health** ones
  - ❖ Preliminary analysis...



# **Pharmaceutical wholesaling in Ghana**

- **640** wholesalers in **Ghana**, **300** in Greater **Accra** Region
- **different size** for those wholesalers: capital, variety of supplied products, agencies, agents
- the **major part are Ghanaian**, some with Indian or European
- lots of them are **importers** but some import only 1 product
- the Ghana pharmaceutical market: "local products", "Indian products", "UK products" (big pharma)



# Okaishie market, « mother of drugs »

- A central place for pharmaceutical wholesaling in Ghana
- "Drug lane", located from the 1950's in the oldest market area of the city (material, jewellery, clothes, shoes...)
  - $\checkmark \ {\it 7 private buildings} \ {\it made with more than 100} \ {\it companies} \ {\it working on pharmaceuticals, mostly wholesalers} \ ({\it it goes inside})$
  - ✓ On the outside, **pedlars** and **stalls** selling every kind of commodities (plastics, dishes, material, shoes, gas bottles, etc.): gives the **impression of being in a urban market**
  - $\checkmark$  The major part of the companies has licences from the  $\mbox{\bf Pharmacy Council}$
- > It is indeed a formal pharmaceutical market but in reality...











# Confrontation between regulation and practices

- To be supervised by a pharmacist (Pharmacy council)
  - often, this pharmacist is not the owner of the place: an employee
  - often, he has **no daily presence** in the shop, he **rents his licence**
- To sell only to licensed retailers
  - pharmacies, drugstores, public and private health centers, authorized wholesalers
  - Ghanaian informal retailers
  - informal wholesalers from French speaking countries: important clientele (number, big purchase, cash)
  - informal intermediary or "independent sales reps": helpful for retailers and wholesalers, activities in case of shortage
    - > Anybody can bulk-buy pharmaceuticals in Okaishie

# Confrontation between regulation and practices

- To sell only authorized products (Food & Drugs Administration)
  - informal sellers who introduce non registered products "from Nigeria": no shops, present in streets...
  - some products that are not yet registered (in progress / FDA)
  - some **products** that are **not anymore registered** (chloroquine)
  - some **products** with **easy manufacturing** (solutes, alcohol, iodine solution, kaolin)
  - some employers who sell products in their employer's back + informal intermediaries' activities: practices which favour the sales of those products



#### An assumed functioning through the market

- Those 3 types of informalities are not all at the same level
- The fact that wholesalers can sell to anybody: few criticisms
- On the issue of the size of clientele: do not force the market
- The issue of **informal intermediaries** and different size of societies: **market model of development** widely **valuable** (*self made-men*)
- From intermediary, to license wholesaler (or retailer), to importer, to importer of "their own" products, to manufacturer
- All those actors **contribute to the market**: reaching the **farthest customer**, the **more remote area**



#### An assumed functioning through the market

- All of them are **working to build the market**: "<u>we</u> have marketed this product"
- In this purpose, various activities of the "sales & medical reps", including social ones (Steiner, 2005), in the ultimate aim of building the market
- This functioning is **not called into question**, **not challenged** by health **authorities**



#### A context of neo-liberalism

- With pharmaceutical wholesaling in Ghana, we are in a **neo-liberal context** as analysed by **Michel Foucault** (2004) and **Loïc Wacquant** (2012)
- It is the **State** who **produce** the **economic competition's rules**
- It is his task to help the market functioning
- "In neo-liberalism, <u>economic activity j</u>ustify ultimately public action, it is the very first reason of its legitimization" (L. **Jeanpierre**, 2006)
- Market is prioritized over anything else (health concerns), most of all taking into account the size of the clientele (informal actors)
- the **3**<sup>rd</sup> **informality**, linked to **products** and **quality**, is more **criticised** by institutional actors: strong FDA
  - > But those 3 types of informalities are not well intertwined?





## Conclusion: an evolution in Global Health?

- This economic and political system: prioritized economic exchange, production of capital, through commodities
- Also promoted by **transnational actors**: foundations, PPP, multilateral institutions, bilateral agencies working with private actors
- In the field of malaria, Global Found, USAID (AMFm, PSCPM, SHOPS): commodities (pharmaceuticals, diagnostic tests) and private sector for public health aims through the Market
- Same tendency in other field: maternal and reproductive health
- Regulation in terms of products (quality, prices) but not in terms of actors involved
- However, **those issues** (actors products) **are linked**: to not recognized it may force to look at possibly **implicit aims** less valuable
  - Important to pursue investigations on societal consequences of dealing with public health concerns through Market

